

Women's Voices Against Cloning

Exploiting women in the name of science.



References for this booklet are listed below:

“This is very much a woman’s issue. I’m trying to get the word out to the world that there is a very strong pro-choice liberal contingent that believes there is something wrong with embryo cloning.”

— Judy Norsigian, Author, “Our Bodies, Ourselves,” quoted by Sheryl Gay Stolberg in “Some for abortion rights lean right in cloning fight,” *The New York Times*, January 24, 2002.

Story of Marilyn Anne Irwin published in *The Lancet*, April 1, 1995

Story of Gillian Norris published in *Daily Mail* (London), March 18, 2003

Story of Temilola Akinbolagbe published in *The Sun*, April 15, 2005

Story of Jo Ann Harris published in *Daily Mail* (London), February 25, 1994; *The Times*, February 25, 1994; *Manchester Guardian Weekly*, March 6, 1994

Story of Jacqueline Rushton published in *The Mirror*, July 7, 2004; *Irish Independent*, November 21, 2003

“In advocating the creation of embryos for stem cell research by means of somatic cell nuclear transfer, [proponents] overlook the fact that human embryos must be created from the eggs of women. Producing eggs engenders increased risks for women. Hyperstimulation can lead to liver damage, kidney failure, or stroke, and ovulation-stimulating drugs have been associated with ovarian cancer, according to some studies.”

— Cynthia B. Cohen, PhD, JD, Kennedy Institute of Ethics, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C., Letter to the Editor, *Journal of the American Medical Association*, March 21, 2001.

Process and risks of egg harvesting:

Duke University Medical Center, Information for Oocyte Donors,
accessed on-line April 11, 2006 at

<http://www2.mc.duke.edu/depts/obgyn/ivf/donor1.htm>

David Magnus, Mildred K. Cho, "Issues in Oocyte Donation for Stem
Cell Research," *Science Express*, May 19, 2005

Ursula Brigitte Kaiser, "The Pathogenesis of the Ovarian
Hyperstimulation Syndrome," *New England Journal of Medicine*, August
21, 2003

Annick Delvigne and Serge Rozenberg, "Epidemiology and prevention
of ovarian hyperstimulation syndrome (OHSS): a review," *Human
Reproduction Update*, November/December, 2002

Reija Klemetti, et al, "Complications of IVF and ovulation induction,"
Human Reproduction, August 26, 2005

Effy Vayena, et al, "Current practices and controversies in assisted
reproduction," Report for World Health Organization, 2002

Stanford University, "Egg donor information project," Accessed on-line
April 11, 2006 at

<http://www.stanford.edu/class/siw198q/websites/eggdonor/procedures.html>

Monash IVF, "Ovarian Hyperstimulation Syndrome," Accessed on-line
April 11, 2006 at

http://www.monashivf.edu.au/library/factsheets/ovarian_hyperstimulation.html

Society for Assisted Reproductive Technology, "Ovarian
Hyperstimulation Syndrome," accessed on-line on April 11, 2006 at

http://www.monashivf.edu.au/library/factsheets/ovarian_hyperstimulation.html

Robert Steinbrook, "Egg donation and Human Embryonic Stem-cell research," *New England Journal of Medicine*, January 26, 2006

Explanation of human cloning by Somatic Cell Nuclear Transfer:

President's Council on Bioethics, "Human Cloning and Human Dignity: An Ethical Inquiry," July 2002, Accessed on-line April 11, 2006 at <http://www.bioethics.gov/reports/cloningreport/index.html>

"As a society we are at a turning point in our relationship to science. We are being asked to make women the servants of biotechnology, rather than insisting on a biotechnology that promotes the well-being of all people."

— Diane Beeson, Ph.D.; medical sociologist, Professor Emerita, California State University in testimony before Subcommittee on Criminal Justice, Drug Policy and Human Resources, U.S. House of Representatives, March 7, 2006

"We believe that current biopolitics are separating men and women from natural reproduction and are robbing women of their biological tissues for experimental technoscience. We will fight together with other feminists for the freedom of women and the welfare of future generations."

— Paola Tavella and Alessandra Di Pietro, feminist authors, Italy in press release statement, "Hands Off Our Ovaries! International Women's Day Brings Launch of a New Coalition of Women," March 8, 2006, accessed on-line March 9, 2006 at <http://www.prweb.com/releases/2006/3/prweb355843.htm>

"There is a disturbing lack of attention to the risks to women's health posed by the advent of embryo cloning...Omitted from the polarized debate is any discussion of the thousands of women who will need to undergo egg extraction procedures for such embryo cloning."

— Judy Norsigian, author, *Our Bodies Ourselves* in "Risks to Women in Embryo Cloning," Opinion Editorial, *Boston Globe*, February 25, 2005

“Soon it will be clear that the ethics of cloning depend not just on how we treat embryos, but also on how we treat the women put to risk by the procedure.”

— Rebecca Dresser, Professor of Ethics in Medicine, Washington University, member of the President’s Council on Bioethics in “Lost in translation,” Opinion Editorial, *St. Louis Post-Dispatch*, March 1, 2005

“Women can die from egg harvesting, or suffer irreversible infertility, and long term effects of the drugs which are used in the process are still being questioned. None of these issues has been adequately addressed by the stem cell scientists eager to get their hands on women’s eggs and ovaries. And all for scientific research which still remains in the realm of hypothetical benefit.”

— Josephine Quintavalle, spokeswoman, Comment on Reproductive Ethics, United Kingdom in press release statement, “Hands Off Our Ovaries! International Women’s Day Brings Launch of a New Coalition of Women,” March 8, 2006, accessed on-line March 9, 2006 at <http://www.prweb.com/releases/2006/3/prweb355843.htm>

“Biotechnological research and development often affects women more directly than men. In the case of human embryonic cloning, women’s health and safety have already been affected—adversely. Sadly, there have been too many instances of coercion and deception, and violations of informed consent. Left uncontrolled, research demands will place undue burdens on young, poor women. We deserve a biotechnology that is not degrading and destructive to women’s health.”

—“Hands off our ovaries” manifesto, accessed on-line on March 17, 2006 at www.handsoffourovaries.com

“If I were a woman, I would definitely donate my eggs to scientific research without hesitation.”

—Woo-suk Hwang, discredited South Korean scientist quoted in “Dr. Hwang Woo-suk: the ‘Stem Cell’ man,” *Korea Times*, June 5, 2004

“Manipulating a woman’s physiology to make her produce large numbers of eggs for research, while encouraging her to do so by paying for them, raises questions of medical and scientific exploitation and ethics that have hardly been discussed.”

—Ruth Hubbard, PhD, biologist, Professor Emerita, Harvard University in “Where is women’s health in the debate on embryo research?,” Council for Responsible Genetics, accessed on-line February 9, 2006 at <http://www.genewatch.org/genewatch/articles/15-2where-women.html>

South Korean ethical shortcuts and safety risks:

Critical shortage of women’s eggs discovered during research in “South Koreans rush to defend cloning researcher against criticism,” reported in “South Koreans rush to defend cloning researcher against criticism,” *The New York Times*, November 29, 2005

Two junior researchers donate their own eggs reported in “Hwang’s forgotten crime,” *New Scientist*, February 4, 2006; “S. Korean stem cell pioneer apologizes for ethics controversy,” *US Fed News*, November 24, 2005

Twenty women were paid; including some in debt who sold their eggs for money in “SNU investigates ova used by Hwang,” *The Korea Herald*, November 23, 2005; “Stem-cell study paid 20 women for eggs,” *The International Herald Tribune*, November 22, 2005; “Hwang’s stem cell team paid for eggs,” *Korea Times*, November 22, 2005

Researchers did not fully explain risks to women ahead of time reported in “Prosecutors conduct six more raids as part of stem cell probe,” *Global News Wire — Asia Africa Intelligence Wire*, January 14, 2006; “Ova donors to file compensation suit,” *Korea Times*, February 7, 2006

Researchers harvested nearly five times more eggs than accounted for, reported in “Ova donors to file compensation suit,” *Korea Times*, February 7, 2006; “Heat o clone expert,” *Herald Sun*, January 11, 2006

In total, researchers collected more than 2000 eggs from 129 women in “Heat on clone expert,” *Herald Sun*, January 11, 2006

Nearly one in five women suffered complications and were hospitalized in “Prosecutors conduct six more raids as part of stem cell probe,”

Global News Wire – Asia Africa Intelligence Wire, January 14, 2006;
“Ova donors to file compensation suit,” *Korea Times*, February 7, 2006

South Korean women’s groups compensation for these women in “Ova donors demand compensation from government,” *AsiaNews.it*, February 7, 2006, accessed on-line on March 16, 2006 at http://www.asianews.it/view_p.php?1=en&art=5322; “Ova donors to file compensation suit,” *Korea Times*, February 7, 2006

Advanced Cell Technology harvests 71 eggs from seven women after advertising in newspaper with offer of payment of \$4000 each as reported in “Don’t expect any miracles,” *New Scientist*, December 1, 2001; “If not today,” *New Scientist*, January 11, 2003; “Deception by researchers relatively rare,” *Washington Post*, January 15, 2006

“Why should women believe anything that researchers with vested interests and conflicts of interests have to say about the risks and benefits of egg extraction?”

—www.handsoffourovary.com accessed on-line March 17, 2006

Quotes from Thomas Okarma and Alan Robins regarding egg harvesting reported by Denise Gellene in “Clone profit? Unlikely,” *Los Angeles Times*, May 10, 2002

In 2004, sixty one million US women in childbearing years from U.S. Census Bureau, “Fertility of American Women: June 2004,” accessed on-line April 11, 2006 at <http://www.census.gov/Press-Release/www/releases/archives/fertility/006141.html>

Testimony of Dr. David A. Prentice, Ph.D. to Legislature of the Commonwealth of Kentucky, Senate Judiciary Committee, Hearing on Human Cloning Ban, H. 138, March 20, 2002

“The commodification of women’s bodies, their eggs and possibly their uteruses, is a very real concern that we all share; and it is yet another reason why we must ban all human cloning, and why we must do so now.”

— Democratic United States Senator Mary Landrieu of Louisiana in “Embryos are not ‘resources,’” Opinion Editorial, *St. Louis Post-Dispatch*, June 3, 2002

“Women’s bodies and women’s eggs are the raw materials of these new human biotechnologies — what forms of violence are they and will they perpetuate against women, and against future generations? . . . We are looking at one of the new forms of violence against women.”

— Sujatha Jesudason, domestic violence prevention expert, U.S. Women Without Borders in “The future of violence against women: Human rights and the new genetics,” Center for Genetics and Society, accessed on-line on March 29, 2006 at http://www.genetics-and-society.org/resources/cgs/20060221_uswwb_jesudason.html